


OPEN PEER REVIEW

Pathology of the Role of Civil Society in Crime Prevention in Iran's Criminal Justice System

Sayyed Heydar. Hoseyni¹  Saleh. Abdinezhad^{2*}  Alireza. Shekarbeigi³ 

¹ PhD Student in Law, Department of Law, Kish International branch, Islamic Azad University, Kish Island, Iran

² Visiting Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Kish International branch, Islamic Azad University, Kish Island, Iran

³ Assistant Professor of Law Department, Payam Noor University, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: salehlawyer29@gmail.com


Received: 2024-02-22

Revised: 2024-04-25

Accepted: 2024-04-30

Published: 2024-05-09


EDITOR:

Yusuf Mohamed 

Department of Architecture and City Design, King Fahd University of Petroleum and Minerals, Dhahran, Saudi Arabia

yusufmohamed@kfupm.edu.sa


REVIEWER 1:

Mehmet Yaşar 

Department of Sociology, Boğaziçi University, 34342 Bebek, Istanbul, Turkey

mehmetyasardo@bogazici.edu.tr

REVIEWER 2:

Sandeep Kotwal 

Knowledge Management Division, National Health Systems Resource Centre, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, New Delhi, India

India

sandkotwal@gmail.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The opening sentence lacks clarity regarding the temporal scope of the claim: "From the beginning of human life on Earth until now, humanity has always been confronted with the issue of crime and delinquency." I suggest refining it by specifying a time frame and giving context, such as historical references or criminological theories that support the claim.

The definition of "criminal policy" could benefit from a comparison with alternative definitions in the literature. Specifically, contrasting Mahdavi Sabet & Moradi (2017) with other contemporary scholars would add depth to your conceptual framework.

In Step 1 of the findings section, you mention reaching "theoretical saturation." However, it is unclear how this was measured. Please include a more explicit explanation of how saturation was determined during the coding process.

The global themes identified in Table 1 are broad, and their connection to the basic themes seems somewhat indirect. It would be helpful to include a more detailed narrative describing how these global themes emerged from the basic themes to strengthen the theoretical grounding.

The sentence "each key sentence or highlighted statement was assigned a code or theme" could benefit from more specificity. Did you use open, axial, or selective coding? Please explain the coding process more clearly.

While the thematic analysis is rich, it might be useful to complement this qualitative insight with some quantitative data (e.g., frequency counts of themes or co-occurrence matrices). Adding a small section on this would offer a mixed-methods approach.

The discussion lacks a comparison with international contexts. Adding comparisons with how civil society interacts with crime prevention in other countries (e.g., Scandinavian or Western European systems) could provide more perspective on the Iranian case.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The introduction mentions several important concepts, but it lacks a detailed literature review that shows where this article contributes to existing research. Consider adding a paragraph summarizing gaps in current research on civil society's role in crime prevention.

The sample size of 12 experts is relatively small. Please provide a stronger justification for why this number is sufficient for the thematic analysis. You could include references to similar studies using a comparable number of participants.

The article states that "thematic analysis" was used but does not elaborate enough on the specifics of data collection. Consider clarifying how semi-structured interviews were conducted, what themes were predefined (if any), and how the theoretical sampling method was applied.

While "repeatability" and "transferability" are mentioned, there is no clear explanation of how these concepts were operationalized during the research. Please include detailed descriptions of the procedures used to ensure these validity and reliability checks were effectively implemented.

Although the article identifies significant challenges within Iran's legislative system, the policy recommendations are underdeveloped. Expanding this section with more concrete suggestions for how civil society's role could be enhanced within the legal framework would be valuable.

Consider exploring the broader implications of your findings beyond Iran. How might these results inform global discussions on civil society's role in minimalist criminal policy?

There is some repetition regarding the role of civil society in crime prevention. For instance, both the introduction and discussion reiterate the "minimalist criminal justice system" concept multiple times without adding new insights. Streamlining this would improve readability.

The transition between the methodology and findings sections feels abrupt. A brief transition paragraph summarizing the methodology's outcomes before delving into the findings would help ease this shift.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.