

# Strategic Scenarios for Enhancing Urban Environmental Resilience in the Cities of Kurdistan Province, Iran

Akbar. Heydari<sup>1\*</sup>, Fardin. Shokravi<sup>2</sup>, Esmail. Safaralizadeh<sup>3</sup>, Robab. Hoseinzadeh<sup>3</sup>, Mohammad Ali. Gholami Sefidkouhi<sup>4</sup>, Shadieh. Heydari Tashe Kaboud<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Geography & Urban Planning, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Department of Environmental Economics, Allameh Tabataba'i University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>3</sup> Department of Urban Geography, Payam-e-Noor University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>4</sup> Department of Water Engineering, Faculty of Agricultural Engineering, Sari Agricultural Sciences and Natural Resources University, Sari, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: Heydariakbar@gmail.com

Received: 2023-05-06

Revised: 2023-06-14

Accepted: 2023-06-20

Published: 2023-07-01

## EDITOR:

Mehmet Çevik

Department of Social Sciences, Ankara University, Türkiye

mehmetcevik@asbu.edu.tr

## REVIEWER 1:

Mustafa Kaan Tuysuz

Institute of Social Sciences, Siirt Universite, Siirt, Turkey

AhmetKılıç@siirt.edu.tr

## REVIEWER 2:

Pınar Reisoğlu

Faculty of Social Sciences, Recep Tayyip Erdogan University, Rize, Turkey

pinarreisoglu@erdogan.edu.tr

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The claim that "urbanization trends are unequal across the globe" would benefit from more recent data and a broader range of examples, particularly from other regions besides Asia, to strengthen the argument and provide a more global perspective.

The explanation of the scoring system used in the cross-impact matrix analysis (e.g., scores ranging from 0 to P) is unclear. It would be helpful to clarify what "P" represents and how the scores are interpreted within the analysis.

The regression model summary in Table 1 could benefit from additional interpretation. Specifically, discuss the implications of the Sum of Squares and the F-statistic in the context of your study's objectives.

The discussion of the Durbin-Watson statistic (1.615) indicates that the residuals are independent, but no further explanation is provided. It would be helpful to elaborate on how this statistic supports the reliability of the regression model.

In Table 3, the term "Impact Layer" is used but not clearly defined. Consider adding a brief explanation of what this term means and how it relates to the overall analysis.

The claim that "future studies may lead to significant negative effects" if certain trends continue is somewhat speculative. It would be beneficial to provide more concrete examples or references to support this assertion.

The discussion mentions that "the model's goodness of fit coefficient is 96.96%," which is very high. It would be important to discuss any potential overfitting issues or explain why this high fit is appropriate for your model.

The uncertainty matrix presented in Figure 1 is crucial to the analysis but lacks a detailed explanation. Consider expanding on how this matrix was constructed and how to interpret the displacement rates shown.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "Urban resilience policies plans and practices have not kept pace with the growth of urbanization and economic development" is a strong claim. Consider providing specific examples or data points to substantiate this statement, particularly in the context of developing countries.

The introduction ends with the research questions, but it might be beneficial to include a brief outline of the paper's structure. This will guide the reader on what to expect in each section of the paper.

The description of the "snowball and Delphi approaches" is somewhat vague. Please expand on how these methods were specifically applied in the study, including how participants were selected and how many iterations of the Delphi process were conducted.

The mention of 903 calculated values in the context of impact-dependence relationships needs further clarification. It would be beneficial to explain how these values were derived and what their significance is to the study's conclusions.

The term "17 descriptors" is introduced without prior explanation in the text. It would be helpful to define what these descriptors are and how they were developed or selected during the research process.

In the description of Scenario One (Optimal Urban Environmental Resilience), the terms "active participation and empowerment" and "visionary planning" are used but are not clearly defined. Consider providing examples or criteria for these terms to add clarity.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.