

OPEN PEER REVIEW

The Evolution of the Concept of Criminal Justice from Punishment-Centeredness to Dejudicialization: A Study on the Functions of Restorative Justice

Amin. Amirian Farsani^{1*}, Mohammad Hasan. Mirshekari²

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Faculty of Humanities Sciences, University of Gonabad, Gonabad, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Najafabad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Najafabad, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: amirian_farsani@gonabad.ac.ir

Received: 2025-07-01	Revised: 2025-11-04	Accepted: 2025-11-11	Initial Publish: 2025-11-15	Final Publish: 2026-12-01
EDITOR: Ghasem Eftekhari Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: eftekhari@ut.ac.ir				
REVIEWER 1: Yusuf Mohamed Department of Architecture and City Design, King Fahd University of Petroleum and Minerals, Dhahran, SaudiArabia. Email: yusufmohamed@kfupm.edu.sa				
REVIEWER 2: Kaushalya Koralage Assistant Lecturer in Sociology				

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Please provide the publication year and exact reference details for Marshall’s definition to maintain academic precision and avoid secondary citation.

The sentence “The Beccarian notion of proportionality between crime and punishment...” could be enhanced by citing Beccaria’s original text or a reputable translation to strengthen historical grounding.

The transition from theoretical discourse to conclusion is too condensed. Consider dividing this into two paragraphs—one summarizing philosophical transformation and one linking it to policy implications.

Sentence “In some countries, including Iran, the traditional justice system is fundamentally punitive...”: This paragraph would benefit from quantitative evidence (e.g., the proportion of punitive versus restorative cases handled annually) to make the critique more empirically grounded.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

To improve clarity, briefly define each mechanism and distinguish their procedural status under Iranian law.

This paragraph could be enriched by including empirical findings (from Iran or other systems) showing improved victim satisfaction levels under restorative programs.

Please specify the psychological or social mechanisms through which behavioral reform is achieved (e.g., empathy training, offender accountability).

The statement “The councils have been active since 2002 in Iran” could be supported by an official source or study assessing their effectiveness in reducing judicial caseloads.

The authors assert that “laws should be revised to grant restorative processes a clear legal foundation...” It would strengthen the argument to specify which particular legal articles or penal code provisions should be revised.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor’s decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief’s decision: Accepted.