OPEN PEER REVIEW



Designing a Conceptual Model of the Journalistic Approach of Arab Newspapers in Covering Health News

Qahtan. Adnan Hashim¹७, Ali. Jafari²*७, Haider. Falh Zayed³७, Narges. Atrian⁴७

- ¹ Department of Communication Sciences, IsF.C., Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran
- ² Department of Partnerships and Communications, Institute for Educational Studies, Educational Research and Planning Organization, Tehran, Iran
- ³ Assistant Professor, Department of Journalism, Dhi Qar University, Nasiriyah, Iraq
- ⁴ Department of Communication Sciences, Shahi.C., Islamic Azad University, Shahinshahr, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: alijafari@oerp.ir

Received: 2025-04-07 Revised: 2025-07-28 Accepted: 2025-08-03 Published: 2026-03-01

EDITOR:
Ghasem Eftekhari
Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: eftekhari@ut.ac.ir
REVIEWER 1:
Mohammadbagher. Jafari
Department of Sociology of Culture, Istanbul, Türkiye. Email: mbjafari@kmanresce.ca
REVIEWER 2:
Vanessa Indama

Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines. Email: vanesindama@gmail.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "The COVID-19 pandemic has profoundly transformed the global media landscape..." would benefit from including region-specific evidence or references about the Arab press rather than relying primarily on global generalizations at this point.

The sentence "Such findings reinforce Goffman's frame analysis, which highlights how media narratives organize experiences and guide interpretations" could be enriched by adding an example from Arab coverage (e.g., use of victim stories, statistics, or reassurance narratives).

The scope of the case study (Al-Sabah, Al-Watan, and Asharq Al-Awsat between 2019 and 2021) is mentioned only briefly. It would strengthen the introduction if you justified why these specific newspapers were chosen (e.g., circulation, influence, ideological diversity).

The sentence "For instance, the frequent reliance on catastrophic headlines created panic..." is powerful but would benefit from a direct quotation or concrete example from Arab newspapers, to demonstrate empirical grounding.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The review of classical communication theories (Lasswell, Berger & Luckmann, Bourdieu, Althusser, Gramsci, Foucault, Hall) is comprehensive but reads as a list. The paragraph would be stronger if you explicitly tied these theoretical perspectives to the Arab press's handling of COVID-19.

In "Hamdy further argues that transparency and trust—vital components of effective health communication—were often undermined by institutional secrecy and political calculations", you should provide more detail on how this specifically manifested in Arab newspapers rather than only citing the secondary literature.

There is an inconsistency: the abstract mentions interviews with 12 experts, while the methodology states 13 university professors. Please clarify the exact number of participants and adjust consistently across the article.

The table is very dense, listing 58 sub-themes. While comprehensive, it may overwhelm the reader. Consider condensing by grouping similar sub-themes or providing an appendix for the full list.

The statement "These categories highlight three overarching axes..." should be more clearly linked to the literature reviewed in the introduction. For example, show how your three axes correspond to existing frameworks (e.g., Hallin & Mancini's models).

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

