OPEN PEER REVIEW



# Comparative Foreign Policies of Iran and Turkey in Iraq and Their Impact on Regional Balance (2003-2019)

Ashoor. Savari Pour<sup>1</sup>, Davood. Kiani<sup>2\*</sup>, Mehdi. Javdani Moghadam<sup>3</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Political Science and International Relations, Qo.C., Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran
- <sup>2</sup> Department of Political Science and International Relations, SR.C., Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran
- <sup>3</sup> Department of Political Science and International Relations, Imam Sadiq University, Tehran, Iran
- \* Corresponding author email address: davood.kiani@iau.ac.ir

Received: 2025-04-01 Revised: 2025-08-04 Accepted: 2025-08-13 Published: 2026-01-01

EDITOR:
Yuyu Zheng®
School of International Relations, University of St Andrews, St Andrews, London, United Kingdom. Email: yuyuzheng@gmail.com
REVIEWER 1:
Vanessa Indama®
Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines. Email: vanesindama@gmail.com
REVIEWER 2:
Mohammadbagher. Jafari®
Department of Sociology of Culture, Istanbul, Türkiye. Email: mbjafari@kmanresce.ca

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In "...literature on Turkey's military posture often overlooks its economic diplomacy...", consider citing at least one concrete example of this gap in the literature to strengthen the claim.

The sentence "Foreign policy, in this context, refers to the aggregate of strategies..." is useful, but would benefit from being moved earlier in the theoretical section to help anchor the reader before diving into theory-specific applications.

The phrase "This foundational rivalry embedded patterns of competition..." should be elaborated with an example from the 20th century to show how pre-modern rivalry shaped modern policy.

The discussion of Turkey's reaction to the U.S. invasion of Iraq rightly mentions its refusal to cooperate in 2003. However, referencing specific parliamentary decisions or public opposition polls would provide additional rigor.

The term "identity politics" is introduced but not expanded. A brief explanation of how identity politics shaped Turkish decision-making (e.g., Sunni solidarity, Turkmen identity) would be useful.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

#### 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:



While the integration of offensive realism, balance of power, and RSCT is theoretically robust, the manuscript would benefit from a clearer justification of why constructivist or liberal approaches were not included, especially given the cultural and identity dynamics in Iraq.

The description of Regional Security Complex Theory is insightful, but it would be helpful to briefly explain how RSCT differs in application from balance of power theory to avoid conceptual redundancy.

The phrase "...reposition Iraq as a critical component in its regional strategy..." would benefit from clarification. What exactly changed in Iran's regional strategy post-2003, and how did Iraq's role become central?

The description of the PMU as "institutionalized" is important. Cite or explain when and how the PMU became part of the official Iraqi security apparatus to support the argument.

While mentioning Iranian media outreach, the sentence would be improved by briefly evaluating their effectiveness compared to other Arabic-language media in Iraq.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

