OPEN PEER REVIEW



Revitalization of Public Rights and Guaranteeing the Common Good: The Reflection of Establishing an Administrative Prosecutor Institution

Mohamad saleh. Noghrekar 10, Ali. Mashhadi 2*0, Seyed Ahmad. Habib Nezhad 30

- ¹ Department of Public Law, Qo.C., Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran
- ² Department of Public and International Law, Faculty of Law, University of Qom, Qo.C., Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran
- ³ Associate Professor, Department of Public Law, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: mashadiali@yahoo.com

Received: 2025-01-26	Revised: 2025-04-01	Accepted: 20	25-04-09 Publ	ished: 2025-07-01
EDITOR:				
Richard Dodder				
Emeritus Professor of	Sociology and of Statist	ics, Oklahoma State	University Stillwater,	Oklahoma, USA. Email:
rdodder@hotmail.com				
REVIEWER 1:				
Yusuf Mohamed [©]				
Department of Architecture and City Design, King Fahd University of Petroleum and Minerals, Dhahran, SaudiArabia. Email:				
yusufmohamed@kfupm.edu.sa				
REVIEWER 2:				
Fatimah Sahdan®				
Faculty of Social a	and Political Sciences	(FISIP) Diponegor	o University,Yogyaka	rta, Indonesia. Email:
fatimahsahdan@rocketma	il.com			

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The reference to "seven levels" of state obligations (recognizing, respecting, promoting...) is insightful, but this framework is introduced without any citation or theoretical foundation. Please provide a supporting reference or expand on how this typology was derived.

The claim that "...rights and freedoms remain vulnerable due to a lack of oversight authority" needs empirical or legislative support. Are there documented examples or cases that illustrate this vulnerability?

You write "The essence of public rights is the transition from the status of 'subject' to that of 'citizen'." This is a profound claim. Consider referencing a foundational theorist such as T.H. Marshall or Hannah Arendt to substantiate this argument.

The list of public rights is extensive and descriptive. Consider reorganizing them into thematic categories (e.g., civil, political, economic) and citing relevant constitutional articles or legal frameworks where each is defined.

The paragraph introducing the fragmentation of legal order due to "subnational" and "supranational" regimes is important. However, this deserves its own section with examples from the Iranian legal system or comparative cases.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The sentence "...only attains practical significance when supported by effective tools and mechanisms under an efficient enforcement guarantee" is general and needs clarity. Specify what kind of tools and what is meant by "efficient enforcement guarantee" in this context.

The article states, "Approximately 400 legal duties have been prescribed for prosecutors" without contextualizing what proportion of these are relevant to administrative matters. This data would benefit from comparative clarification.

The definition of "public institution" is extremely long and lacks clarity. Please consider breaking this definition into bullet points or a table to improve readability.

The text refers to "principles frequently observed across different legal systems" without specifying which systems. Indicating whether this refers to common law, civil law, or hybrid systems would improve the academic rigor.

The list of "examples of the common good" is helpful but static. Could the authors elaborate on how these are protected or violated in the Iranian context?

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

