OPEN PEER REVIEW

The Geopolitical Competition of the United States, China, and Russia in the Persian Gulf and Its Impact on the Security of the Islamic Republic of Iran

Mohammad Hadi. Vaez Mahdavi^{1*}, Mohammad Reza. Dehshiri²

¹ Master's Degree, Department of Diplomacy and International Organizations, Faculty of International Relations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Tehran, May Iran

² Professor, Department of International Relations, Faculty of International Relations, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: m.hadi.vaezmahdavi@gmail.com

Received: 2025-03-15	Revised: 2025-03-07	Accepted: 2025-02-03	Published: 2025-03-26
EDITOR:			
Tahereh Ebrahimifar 🗓			
Head of Sociology Department, Faculty of Arts, Helwan University,Cairo, Egypt. Email: Tah.Ebrahimifar@iauctb.ac.ir			
REVIEWER 1:			
Vanessa Indama [®]			
Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines. Email: vanesindama@gmail.com			
REVIEWER 2:			
Mohammadbagher. Jafarilo			
Department of Sociology of Culture, Istanbul, Türkiye. Email: mbjafari@kmanresce.ca			

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

In the first paragraph, the phrase "has always been one of the most strategic regions in the world" is a sweeping generalization. Consider specifying time frames or citing historical sources to substantiate the claim.

In the sentence "the United Arab Emirates...positioning itself as the 'Sparta of the new world", provide a citation or source for this phrase, or clarify if it is a metaphorical characterization by the authors.

In the paragraph referencing Barry Buzan, the distinction between "power-security" and "defense-security" is introduced, but not integrated into the later analysis. Either elaborate on their relevance or consider removing them for cohesion.

In the paragraph beginning "Alongside these initiatives, the U.S. has intensified efforts...", the statement about Sudan and Morocco's participation in the Abraham Accords lacks a citation. Please add appropriate references.

The statement "...estimated at approximately \$12 billion...an annual average expenditure of \$3 billion" in the Russia section (regarding the Soviet-Afghan war) requires citation or source validation for transparency.

The paragraph on Iran's use of soft power states, "Public diplomacy, media engagement...serve as effective instruments..." without offering concrete examples or outcomes. Including case studies or data would substantiate the claim

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the paragraph discussing Ullah and Xinlei (2024), the review is largely descriptive. Consider critically engaging with their conclusions and linking them explicitly to the present study's objectives.

The literature review omits discussions on the security dilemma theory or strategic hedging in the Gulf region. Including references to key theoretical gaps would better justify the study's contribution.

The section states, "The present study adopts the Copenhagen School..." but the explanation is somewhat superficial. Expand on the concept of "securitization" and explain how it is operationalized in this context.

The paragraph discussing Saudi Arabia's arms deal with Russia lacks context. How does this compare with similar U.S. or Chinese deals? A comparative approach would enrich the geopolitical analysis.

The paragraph starting with "The outbreak of the Russia-Ukraine war further reshaped China's role..." mixes past and present tense and confuses timelines. Clarify whether the rise in Chinese arms exports is a result or a continuation of previous trends.

The paragraph stating "...Iran has reinforced its long-standing policy of regional cooperation..." should be reconciled with the earlier mention of direct attacks on Israel in April 2024. These events appear contradictory without deeper geopolitical explanation.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted. Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.

