

The Impact of Urban Fabric on the Formation of Criminal Thought: A Study of the Traditional and Modern Fabric of Yazd

Amirmohammad. Taraz^{1*}, Mohammadhossein. Zarei², Mohammadmehdi. Barghi^{Error! Reference source not found.}

¹ Ph.D student in Criminal Law and Criminology at Aras International Campus, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

² Aras International Campus, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Mhzarie@ut.ac.ir

Received: 2025-06-01 Revised: 2025-03-04 Accepted: 2025-03-13 Published: 2025-12-01

EDITOR:

Ghasem Eftekhari

Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: eftekhari@ut.ac.ir

REVIEWER 1:

Jingjing Wang

Law School, Peking University (PKU), Peking, China. Email: jingwang@vip.sina.com

REVIEWER 2:

Abdus Samad

Assistant Professor, Department of Law, AWKUM, Pakistan. Email: abdussamad@awkum.edu.pk

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The article refers to criminal thought as an evolving process influenced by urban fabric but does not operationalize it clearly. The phrase “criminal thought—that ominous shadow that sometimes infiltrates the recesses of the mind” is poetic but lacks a precise legal or psychological definition. Clarify whether criminal thought refers to intent, perception of crime, or actual criminal behaviors.

While the study discusses crime patterns in Yazd, it lacks comparative statistics from other Iranian or international cities with similar traditional-modern dichotomies. If possible, include references to crime data in other UNESCO-heritage cities (e.g., Isfahan, Fez, or Marrakesh) to contextualize Yazd’s experience.

The study extensively discusses the physical features of Yazd but does not employ geospatial analysis tools such as GIS. The phrase “a secluded corner, a dimly lit street, or a broken lock may all serve as catalysts for criminal behavior” suggests spatial crime patterns that could be more rigorously analyzed through heat maps or crime density analysis.

The claim “Installing solar-powered or LED streetlights that preserve the area's historical identity while eliminating dark hiding spots can be effective” in the policy recommendations is strong but lacks supporting evidence. Include examples of successful crime reduction via improved lighting, possibly referencing CPTED studies.

The study suggests that modern urban fabric increases crime rates due to anonymity, yet it does not control for socioeconomic factors. The statement “residents may not even know their next-door neighbors, and this detachment has eroded community supervision” implies social disintegration but does not analyze whether income levels, education, or employment affect crime tendencies in these neighborhoods.

The study mentions semi-structured interviews with residents and experts in urban planning and criminology but does not provide sample quotations or detailed participant perspectives. Adding direct excerpts from interviews would strengthen qualitative validity.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The introduction presents a strong argument about the connection between urban fabric and criminal thought. However, the phrase "Yazd, with its two distinct faces, appears as a courtroom where tradition and modernity stand trial against each other" is metaphorical but does not explicitly introduce the study's criminological and legal framework. It would be clearer if followed by a more direct link to urban crime theories.

The study extensively discusses urban design and crime, yet it does not sufficiently address urban planning policies in Iran or international comparative cases. Adding legal or urban planning regulations that influence Yazd's structure would enhance the study's practical relevance.

The theoretical framework mentions Broken Windows Theory, Opportunity Theory, and CPTED, but the transition from these theories to the empirical study is abrupt. The sentence "These criminological theories, each offering a unique perspective on the relationship between urban environments and behavior, provide the conceptual framework for this study" should be expanded to justify why these theories were specifically chosen over others, such as Routine Activity Theory.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.