

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Combating Gender-Based Crimes in Armed Conflicts Stemming from Extremism from the Perspective of Islamic Jurisprudence and International Law

Homaira. Ahmadi¹, Ebad. Rouhi^{2*}, Farid. Azadbakht³, Faramarz. Amgadian³

¹ PhD student, Department of International Law, Kermanshah Branch, Azad University, Kermanshah, Iran.

² Assistant Professor of Public International Law Department of Law, Sanandaj Branch, Islamic Azad University, Sanandaj, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Kermanshah Branch, Islamic Azad University, Kermanshah, Iran.

* Corresponding author email address: ibadruhi@gmail.com

Received: 2025-01-03	Revised: 2025-02-14	Accepted: 2025-03-02	Published: 2025-04-21
EDITOR: Cavid Qasimov Prof, Faculty of Letters Department of History, Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Van, Turkiye. Email: cavidqasimov@yyu.edu.tr			
REVIEWER 1: Kaushalya Korlage Assistant Lecturer in Sociology at University of Colombo, Colombo, Sri Lanka. Email: korlage@iouc.cmb.ac.lk			
REVIEWER 2: Vanessa Indama Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines. Email: vanesindama@gmail.com			

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

While Quranic verses are well-cited, the distinction between moral transgressions (e.g., sin) and legal crimes could be clarified for a non-Muslim legal audience.

Please identify or cite the scholars mentioned here. Without references, the claim lacks academic grounding.

Consider elaborating on how this broad UN definition intersects with or differs from Islamic legal interpretations of domestic violence.

This subjective phrasing reduces academic neutrality. Consider rephrasing using third-person academic language or support the claim with a citation.

The method of "lighting fires" as symbolic protection is intriguing. Clarify its historical accuracy and whether this is widely accepted among Islamic historians.

The reference to WMD prohibition is commendable. However, it would be beneficial to clarify the link between early Islamic practices and modern definitions of WMD.

The phrase implies modern ethical judgment. Consider rephrasing for historical neutrality or providing scholarly commentary.

You state that international courts "formally criminalized various forms of sexual violence." Please specify the exact provisions from the Rome Statute (e.g., Article 7, Article 8).

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

Please cite specific years or tribunal documents to support this historical claim. It would also be helpful to mention when the change in prosecutorial approach occurred.

The objectives of the article and the research questions are repeated. Consider consolidating to avoid redundancy and enhance coherence.

The verse references are well-done, but the logical link to women-specific protections needs to be clarified. Consider stating explicitly how these verses apply to women's protection during war.

Consider rephrasing in a more academic tone. Also, cite sources from Islamic jurisprudential literature that support this theological interpretation of enforcement.

The principle of distinction is stated. Please consider explicitly comparing it with international humanitarian law's principle of distinction under the Geneva Conventions for clarity.

There is a strong assertion that Prophet Muhammad implemented principles of modern humanitarian law. This needs to be contextualized with a scholarly comparison between Islamic sources and modern IHL.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.