

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Civil and Political Rights of Minorities in Iraq After 2003

Fadhil Abbas. Sabah Al-Kuraiti¹ Bahram. Montazeri^{2*} Khalid. Oleiwi Jiad³ Mohammadreza. Agharebparast²

¹ PhD student, Public Policy Department, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran

² Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science and International Relations, Shahreza Branch, Islamic Azad University, Shahreza, Iran

³ Professor, Department of Political Science and Islamic Political Thought, University of Karbala, Karbala, Iraq

* Corresponding author email address: Bmontazeri12@yahoo.com

Received: 2024-08-16

Revised: 2024-10-23

Accepted: 2024-11-05

Published: 2025-01-01

EDITOR:

Tahereh Ebrahimifar

Head of Sociology Department, Faculty of Arts, Helwan University, Cairo, Egypt.

Email: Tah.Ebrahimifar@iauctb.ac.ir

REVIEWER 1:

Shehzad Raj

School of Law, Universiti Geomatika Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

shehzadraj@geomatika.edu.my

REVIEWER 2:

Jingjing Wang

Law School, Peking University (PKU), Peking, China

jingwang@vip.sina.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement, "Iraq is characterized by significant ethnic and religious diversity," could benefit from references to demographic data sources to support this assertion.

The introduction lacks a clear statement on how the current study differs from previous works on minority rights in Iraq. Adding a concise literature gap section would improve the rationale.

Tables or figures summarizing key findings (e.g., rights granted vs. rights implemented) would improve clarity and visual appeal.

It would strengthen the study if findings were linked back to relevant legal or sociopolitical theories on minority rights protection.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The research questions should be explicitly stated in bullet points to enhance readability and emphasis.

The phrase, "larger and controlling elements," used to describe dominant groups, could be replaced with a more precise term such as "majority political factions."

There should be a discussion on how reliability and validity of data collection were ensured, especially given the historical nature of the analysis.

The findings should include comparisons between minority rights in Iraq and other post-conflict countries to provide broader context.

When discussing specific constitutional articles (e.g., Article 2 and Article 4), a critical evaluation of how these provisions have been practically enforced is needed.

The findings currently treat all minorities as a collective; consider providing specific insights into different minority groups to highlight unique challenges and experiences.

The discussion should elaborate on potential legal reforms or policy recommendations to enhance minority rights protection.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.