

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Instances of Violations of Fair Trial in Municipal Administrative Courts

Ali Asghar. Rezaei¹  Hojatollah. Ebrahimian^{2*}  Mohammad Ali. Kafaefar³ 

¹ PhD Student, Department of Public Law, Qom Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Public Law, Qom Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Public Law, Qom Branch, Islamic Azad University, Qom, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: Hojjat49@gmail.com

Received: 2024-10-14

Revised: 2024-12-08

Accepted: 2024-12-17


Published: 2025-04-01

EDITOR:

Ghasem Eftekhari 


Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. Email: eftekhari@ut.ac.ir

REVIEWER 1:

Abdus Samad 

Assistant Professor, Department of Law, AWKUM, Pakistan . Email: abdussamad@awkum.edu.pk

REVIEWER 2:

Jingjing Wang 

Law School, Peking University (PKU), Peking, China . Email: jingwang@vip.sina.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The phrase "social environment of the system" is vague. Clarify whether you mean urban governance, legal frameworks, or social structures. Additionally, it would be beneficial to cite relevant urban law literature here.

The article claims that members of the first-instance and appellate bodies must be different, but it does not analyze whether this requirement is consistently followed in practice. Provide evidence or case studies to demonstrate compliance or violations.

Is ten days considered a sufficient period under international legal standards for a fair defense? Compare with due process standards in other jurisdictions.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The discussion on the composition of the Article 100 Municipal Commission would benefit from a comparison with similar commissions in other jurisdictions to contextualize whether its structure is unique or common in administrative law.

Provide more detail on how the appellate process differs procedurally from the initial stage. Does it allow for new evidence? What are the grounds for appeal?

Consider elaborating on how the presence of a non-voting municipal representative influences decision-making. Is their advisory role neutral, or does it risk bias?

The argument about financial dependence affecting judicial impartiality is compelling. However, it would be beneficial to include comparative examples from other countries where financial independence mechanisms exist.

This claim should be supported by citations from legal studies or human rights frameworks that emphasize the importance of public hearings in administrative justice.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.