

OPEN PEER REVIEW

# The Scale of Optimal Family Governance in Light of Conventional Dowries and Crime Prevention

Hossein. Ramezani<sup>1</sup>, Hormuz Asadi. Kouhbad<sup>2\*</sup>, Mohammad Ali. Heydari<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> PhD Student, Department of Fiqh and Fundamentals of Islamic Law, Najaf Abad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Najaf Abad, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Law, Ramhormoz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ramhormoz, Iran

<sup>3</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Fiqh and Fundamentals of Islamic Law, Najaf Abad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Najaf Abad, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: Asadi.koohbad@gmail.com

Received: 2024-07-13

Revised: 2024-09-11

Accepted: 2024-09-25

Published: 2024-10-01

## EDITOR:

Nabeel Bani-Hani

Faculty of Education Specialization, Wasit University, Wasit, Iraq. Email: nabeelhani@uowasit.edu.iq

## REVIEWER 1:

Mrinalini Puranik

National Health Mission, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, India. Email: MriPuranik@gmail.com

## REVIEWER 2:

Thanuja Kulasooriya

Department Soil Science, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Ruhuna, Mapalana, Kamburupitiya, Sri Lanka. Email: thkulasooriya@soil.ruh.ac.lk

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

Typographical Error in Introduction: In the first sentence of the Introduction, "he family is the fundamental element..." appears to contain a typographical error. It should be corrected to "The family is the fundamental element..." to ensure clarity and professionalism.

Section 2.2 provides a general definition of NGOs. To strengthen the argument, it would be useful to specify the types of NGOs active in the context of dowry practices in Islamic societies, including examples and their specific roles.

In Section 2.3, the connection between judicial security and national security is asserted. Clarifying this linkage with references to relevant Islamic jurisprudence or contemporary examples within Islamic countries would provide a stronger foundation for the argument.

In Section 3.3, the influence of cultural norms on dowry practices is highlighted. Expanding on how specific cultural factors within different Islamic communities affect dowry customs would offer a more nuanced understanding of the issue.

Section 3.2 discusses the potential role of NGOs in advocating for dowry reforms. Assessing the current effectiveness of existing NGOs in similar contexts, perhaps through case studies or performance metrics, would strengthen the argument for their expanded role.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The Introduction mentions dowries as "a gift for the wife" based on rights and responsibilities. It would enhance clarity to provide a more comprehensive definition of dowry within Islamic law, possibly citing specific sources or legal texts that delineate its traditional role.

The statement "Over time, however, the economic perspective has dominated the nature and form of dowries" would benefit from empirical data or references to studies that illustrate this shift from a traditional to an economic perspective.

In the Introduction, the claim that excessive dowries lead to "financial disputes within families, legal proceedings... and even divorce" should be supported with statistical evidence or case studies that quantify or exemplify these outcomes.

In Section 2.1, the role of the people in governance is discussed primarily from a democratic perspective. It would be beneficial to align this discussion more explicitly with Islamic governance principles to maintain coherence with the article's focus on Islamic societies.

Throughout Section 3.1, references to Islamic jurisprudence and traditions are made. Including direct citations from primary Islamic legal sources (e.g., Quranic verses, Hadiths) would substantiate these claims and provide a more authoritative basis for the arguments presented.

The concept of "expediency" is central to the argument in Section 3.1. It would be beneficial to elaborate on how expediency is interpreted within different Islamic legal schools and its practical application in contemporary dowry regulations.

When discussing proposed reforms, such as setting a ceiling for dowries in Section 4.1, including examples from countries that have implemented similar measures would provide practical insights and validate the feasibility of these suggestions.

In Section 3.5, the relationship between dowry practices and the Iranian Civil Code is mentioned. A more detailed analysis of relevant legal provisions and how they interact with Islamic law would provide deeper insights into the legal challenges and opportunities for reform.

The argument that excessive dowries place an economic burden on husbands is presented in Section 3.5. Incorporating economic data or studies that quantify this burden would add empirical weight to the discussion.

Section 3.4 outlines religious criteria for optimal family governance. Providing specific interpretations from recognized Islamic scholars or authorities on dowry practices would enhance the credibility and depth of this section.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.