

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Conflict of Interest in Governance Based on the New Islamic Civilization Model: Considering Public Law Principles

Khairollah. Parvin^{1*}, Amirhossein. Khorshidi Organi²

¹ PhD Student, Department of Public Law, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

² Professor, Department of Public Law, Faculty of Law and Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: khparvin@ut.ac.ir

Received: 2024-08-19

Revised: 2024-10-09

Accepted: 2024-10-16

Published: 2025-01-01

EDITOR:

Eman Shenouda

Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: ens01@fayoum.edu.eg

REVIEWER 1:

Vanessa Indama

Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines. Email: vanesindama@gmail.com

REVIEWER 2:

Mohammadbagher. Jafari

Department of Sociology of Culture, Istanbul, Türkiye. Email: mbjafari@kmanresce.ca

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction states, "Islamic civilization emerges when a set of ethical and material conditions are met without conflict or through the proper management of arising conflicts." This statement assumes that Islamic civilization inherently seeks conflict management but does not cite any historical or jurisprudential sources. Consider providing references from Islamic scholars or legal theorists.

The paragraph discussing Aristotle's governance principles lacks a direct connection to the New Islamic Civilization model. Consider explaining how Aristotle's ideas align with or contrast with Islamic governance principles, particularly in relation to shura (consultation) and public welfare.

The phrase "some argue that the concept of public order in the context of public law is ambiguous" lacks specificity regarding which legal scholars hold this view. Provide references to clarify which legal traditions or scholars assert this claim.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The text asserts that "the realization of the New Islamic Civilization cannot be summarized as simply providing a good government." However, the distinction between governance and good government remains vague. It would be helpful to clarify,

with supporting sources, how governance principles in the New Islamic Civilization differ from conventional good governance models.

The definition of conflict of interest references legal cases from 1949 but does not acknowledge contemporary Islamic jurisprudence on the subject. Consider incorporating recent Islamic legal perspectives on conflict of interest to strengthen the argument.

The reference to Surah Al-Baqarah regarding wine and gambling states that "interest" and "benefit" are interchangeable. However, this interpretation may require further jurisprudential support, as "interest" (maslaha) and "benefit" (manfa'ah) have nuanced differences in Islamic law.

The discussion on Islamic civilization is broad but lacks specific historical examples. Consider integrating concrete instances from different Islamic periods (e.g., Abbasid, Ottoman, Safavid) to demonstrate the evolution of governance within the Islamic framework.

The text states that "public law is based on three fundamental principles: authority, the rule of law, and accountability." However, contemporary governance models, including Islamic governance, also emphasize transparency and public participation. Consider expanding the discussion to include these additional principles.

The text differentiates between theoretical and practical reason but does not apply this distinction to contemporary governance challenges. Consider discussing how this distinction impacts legal decision-making in modern Islamic governance.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.