

OPEN PEER REVIEW

# Protection of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Armed Conflicts through the International Humanitarian Law

Janet. Blake<sup>1</sup>, Alireza. Goodarzi<sup>2\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Associate Professor, Department of Human Rights and Environmental Law, Faculty of Law, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Ph.D. Candidate in Public International Law, Faculty of Law, Shahid Beheshti University, Tehran, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: goodarzi.alireza@ut.ac.ir

Received: 2024-08-02

Revised: 2024-10-10

Accepted: 2024-10-18


Published: 2024-10-25

## EDITOR:

Vanessa Indama


Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines  
vanesindama@gmail.com

## REVIEWER 1:

Yusuf Mohamed

Department of Architecture and City Design, King Fahd University of Petroleum and Minerals, Dhahran, Saudi Arabia  
yusufmohamed@kfupm.edu.sa

## REVIEWER 2:

Agwu Sunday Okoro

Lecturer & Clinical Law Administrator at Baze University Abuja, Abuja, Nigeria  
agwuokoro@gmail.com

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"The sentence 'Each of these three components may be damaged in the course of armed conflicts and thus affect the viability of ICH' could benefit from a concrete example to strengthen the claim. For instance, you might mention a specific conflict that had a notable impact on cultural properties."

"The phrase 'hence, its three vital components are examined' needs clarification. It might be useful to briefly specify which components are reviewed and how their examination ties into your research objectives."

"The explanation of erga omnes obligations is quite thorough, but it might be helpful to explore potential criticisms or limitations of this approach. How does this concept align or conflict with state sovereignty?"

"The sentence 'The relationship, as mentioned in Article 2(1) of the 2003 Convention...' needs more empirical evidence or examples to support the claim that cultural diversity correlates directly with biodiversity."

"The discussion on ENMOD (p. 12) could benefit from a comparison with more recent environmental protection treaties. How does ENMOD hold up against newer international regulations or environmental challenges?"

"The analysis of 'Geneva Law' is comprehensive but could be enriched by discussing the practical challenges of enforcing these protections in contemporary conflicts. Are there notable examples where enforcement has failed or succeeded?"

"The sentence 'According to Article 24, orphan children...' needs expansion. Discuss how cultural traditions have been preserved or lost in cases of displaced or orphaned populations during conflicts."

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

"The sentence 'It should be accepted that the distinction between tangible and intangible...' (p. 2) requires a more critical analysis of why this distinction is seen as 'artificial and unrealistic.' Adding counterarguments or discussing opposing scholarly views would enrich this discussion."

"Consider expanding on Articles 146 and 147 of the Fourth Geneva Convention by linking them explicitly to their relevance for cultural heritage protection. How do these provisions specifically apply to ICH beyond civilian property?"

"The explanation of 'The Hague UNESCO Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflicts' is well-detailed, but it could be strengthened by discussing the current challenges or limitations in its implementation in modern conflicts."

"The description of the 'Stella of Matara' case would benefit from additional analysis of the broader implications of the case on international law. How has this precedent influenced subsequent cases or legal discourse?"

"The conclusion states that 'UNESCO must take positive action.' It would be more compelling if specific policy recommendations or a framework for action were provided. How should UNESCO prioritize its initiatives?"

"The reference to the 'Operational Directives' would be more impactful if it included specific examples of how ICH has been used to promote peace or resolve disputes in post-conflict settings."

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.