

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Analyzing the Relationship Between Good Governance, Social Order, Social Commitment, and Citizens' Belief in Social Values: A Case Study of Garmsar Citizens

Ahmad. Amiri^{1*}, Nayer. Pirahari², Mojtaba. Sedaghati Fard²

¹ PhD Student Department of Sociology, Garmsar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Garmsar, Iran

² Assistant Professor Department of Sociology, Garmsar Branch, Islamic Azad University, Garmsar, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: n_pirahari@yahoo.com

Received: 2024-05-12

Revised: 2024-07-29

Accepted: 2024-08-04

Published: 2024-08-12

EDITOR:

Vanessa Indama

Public Administration Department, Basilan State College, Isabela City, Basilan, Philippines

vanesindama@gmail.com

REVIEWER 1:

Yusuf Mohamed

Department of Architecture and City Design, King Fahd University of Petroleum and Minerals, Dhahran, Saudi Arabia

yusufmohamed@kfupm.edu.sa

REVIEWER 2:

Agwu Sunday Okoro

Lecturer & Clinical Law Administrator at Baze University Abuja, Abuja, Nigeria

agwuokoro@gmail.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

"The term 'privacy' originates from the Arabic word 'Harem'..." This is an important etymological point, but it could benefit from a more thorough explanation of the cultural and legal connotations of 'privacy' in both traditional and contemporary settings in Iran and Iraq. Discuss how these interpretations have evolved over time.

The literature review lacks a clear theoretical framework. I recommend introducing key privacy theories, such as those related to "privacy as control over information" or the distinction between legal and moral rights. This would provide a stronger foundation for the comparative analysis.

The description of the methodology is vague. The phrase "using a descriptive-analytical method" does not sufficiently explain the criteria or sources for evaluating privacy laws. Clarify whether doctrinal research or empirical methods were used and outline the specific data sources and analysis techniques employed.

There is a heavy reliance on secondary sources. To strengthen the analysis, incorporate more primary legal texts, such as articles from the constitutions of Iran and Iraq, or recent amendments to privacy laws. This would enhance the credibility of your legal interpretations.

"The legislative philosophy which aims to preserve and protect..." — While this is an important conclusion, the policy implications are underdeveloped. Suggest specific legal reforms that could improve privacy protections in Iran and Iraq, taking into account international standards and technological challenges.

This section would be more comprehensive if it also included a discussion of privacy in the context of emerging technologies such as artificial intelligence and blockchain. How do the legal systems in Iran and Iraq anticipate these technological advancements?

The paper lacks concrete examples. Including relevant case studies, especially high-profile cases involving privacy violations in Iran and Iraq, would enrich the analysis and provide practical insights into how privacy laws are enforced.

The paper could benefit from a more nuanced discussion of the cultural context. How do cultural perceptions of privacy in Iran and Iraq influence the development and enforcement of privacy laws? This would provide a deeper understanding of the legal systems.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The discussion of cyberspace privacy is quite superficial. To improve this section, incorporate more modern issues such as data breaches, cyberstalking, and governmental surveillance, and explain how Iran and Iraq address these challenges differently.

The terms "privacy," "personal data," and "confidentiality" are used interchangeably in multiple sections. It is crucial to define these terms early on and maintain consistency throughout the paper to avoid confusion.

The influence of Islamic law on privacy protection is not adequately explored. Provide a deeper analysis of how interpretations of Islamic jurisprudence, especially under Imamiyyah doctrine, affect privacy laws in both Iran and Iraq. This will add depth to the legal comparison.

"It is concluded that although numerous laws concerning privacy have been enacted..." This conclusion is too vague. Provide specific examples of where Iranian and Iraqi laws converge or diverge. Detailed case studies or examples of legal precedents would make the comparative analysis more robust.

The brief mention of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) is insufficient. Expand this section to explore how international treaties, particularly the ICCPR, influence domestic privacy laws in Iran and Iraq. Discuss compliance and enforcement mechanisms.

The assertion that Iraqi laws are better aligned with international standards is made without much evidence. Strengthen this claim by providing a more detailed comparison using international benchmarks such as the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR).

Ensure all citations are up-to-date and accurately reflect the sources used. For example, in Paragraph 4, the reference to "Ansari 2017" does not seem to align with the text. Review all citations carefully for consistency and accuracy.

The concluding section is somewhat general. Rework the conclusion to summarize the key findings of the comparative analysis in more detail, including specific areas where Iranian and Iraqi laws differ significantly in their approach to privacy.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.