

OPEN PEER REVIEW

Analysis of the Role of the Unconscious in Surrealism and its Comparison with Symbolism in Expressing the Concept of Imagination in Ibn Arabi's Mystical Revelations

Faraz. Tajallinasr^{1*} ¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Arabic Language and Literature, Khorramabad Branch, Islamic Azad University, Khorramabad, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: tajalli.nasr@gmail.com

Received: 2024-01-04

Revised: 2024-03-02

Accepted: 2024-03-10

Published: 2024-03-13

EDITOR:Nabeel Bani-Hani 


Faculty of Education Specialization, Wasit University, Wasit, Iraq

nabeelhani@uowasit.edu.iq

REVIEWER 1:Fatimah Sahdan 

Faculty of Social and Political Sciences (FISIP) Diponegoro University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia

fatimahsahdan@rocketmail.com

REVIEWER 2:Mrinalini Puranik 

National Health Mission, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, India

MriPuranik@gmail.com

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The statement that Symbolism "emphasizes symbolism and imagery" appears somewhat redundant. Consider rephrasing to avoid repetition and provide a clearer distinction between the roles of symbolism in Symbolism and Surrealism.

The section could benefit from expanding the discussion of the psychoanalytic influence on Surrealism. A more detailed explanation of Freud's concepts, particularly his theories on the unconscious, would better support the connection to Surrealism.

The description of "mental automatism" in Surrealism lacks clarity. Consider expanding this explanation, possibly with an example of automatic writing or art, to provide a more vivid understanding of the technique.

The sentence "This technique frees the writer from the constraints of the conscious and rational mind..." could benefit from elaboration on how this process specifically relates to uncovering the unconscious.

While the section highlights similarities between Ibn Arabi's philosophy and Surrealism, it could benefit from a more explicit comparison. Consider drawing parallels with key Surrealist figures, such as André Breton, to provide a clearer comparative analysis.

The sentence "He believes that imagination holds truth and is free from falsehood..." introduces an important concept but lacks in-depth exploration. Expanding on how Ibn Arabi's imagination acts as a bridge between the sensory and divine realms would enrich the analysis.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The link between Ibn Arabi's mystical thoughts and Symbolism/Surrealism is central to the article but is not explained sufficiently here. Consider including a brief overview of Ibn Arabi's philosophical stance on dreams and imagination to provide context early in the paper.

The research questions are broad and could benefit from further refinement. For example, specifying which particular aspects of Surrealism and Symbolism will be compared with Ibn Arabi's ideas could add focus to the study.

When discussing the emergence of Symbolism, it would be useful to cite specific examples of influential Symbolist works or authors (e.g., Baudelaire, Verlaine) to ground the discussion in specific literary and artistic contributions.

The claim that Symbolism "with its emphasis on emotions and inner experiences played a crucial role in shaping psychoanalysis" is interesting but lacks supporting references. Providing scholarly citations for this claim would strengthen the argument.

A more thorough analysis of how Surrealists like Breton or Dalí used symbols and how this compares with Ibn Arabi's spiritual symbols could strengthen the article's central argument.

The comparison between Surrealism's use of imagery and Ibn Arabi's symbolic imagination feels underdeveloped. Consider incorporating more specific examples from both Surrealism (e.g., Dalí's paintings) and Ibn Arabi's works to substantiate the analysis.

The sentence "Both pursue the depth of existence and truth..." is somewhat vague. Clarifying the specific nature of "truth" as understood in Surrealism (psychological) and Ibn Arabi's philosophy (spiritual) would enhance the comparison.

The conclusion reiterates key points but could benefit from more specific reflections on the implications of the study. How does this comparison advance our understanding of Symbolism, Surrealism, or Islamic mysticism?

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.