

OPEN PEER REVIEW

# Sociological Analysis of the Destruction of Cultural and Artistic Heritage of Mosul by ISIS: A Verstehen Approach (Max Weber, Ibn Khaldun, Dr. Ali Al-Wardi)

Ahmad. Shouli<sup>1\*</sup>, Mohammad. Aref<sup>2</sup>, Mohammadreza. Sharifzadeh<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> PhD student, Department of Art Research, Faculty of Art, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>2</sup> Associate Professor, Theater Department, Faculty of Arts, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

<sup>3</sup> Professor, Department of Art Research, Faculty of Art, Central Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

\* Corresponding author email address: m.aref@iauctb.ac.ir

| Received: 2023-08-24   | Revised: 2023-09-15 | Accepted: 2023-09-21 | Published: 2023-10-01 |
|--|---------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|
| <b>EDITOR:</b><br>Eman Shenouda <sup>id</sup><br>Associate Professor, Department of Psychology, Isfahan (Khorasgan) Branch, Islamic Azad University, Isfahan, Iran. Email: ens01@fayoum.edu.eg                   |                     |                      |                       |
| <b>REVIEWER 1:</b><br>Fatimah Sahdan <sup>id</sup><br>Faculty of Social and Political Sciences (FISIP) Diponegoro University, Yogyakarta, Indonesia. Email: fatimahsahdan@rocketmail.com                         |                     |                      |                       |
| <b>REVIEWER 2:</b><br>Muhammad Abdul Rahman <sup>id</sup><br>Department of Humanities, Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. Email: muhammadrahman@ntu.edu.sg |                     |                      |                       |

## 1. Round 1

### 1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The sentence "The preservation and destruction of cultural and historical artifacts is a prominent issue in contemporary society" is too broad. Provide specific context about Mosul early in the introduction to set the stage for your analysis.

The phrase "loss of numerous irreplaceable historical artifacts" needs quantitative support. Mention specific examples of destroyed artifacts and provide a clearer picture of the magnitude of the destruction.

You cite several scholars discussing the failures of international law (e.g., Lasani and Heydari). Consider adding a specific subsection on international legal gaps to provide a structured analysis of these shortcomings.

The section discussing Max Weber's theory lacks depth. While it mentions Weber's work on rationalization, the link to Mosul's cultural heritage should be clearer. Discuss how Weber's theory of disenchantment of the world applies to the destruction of religiously significant artifacts.

The inclusion of Al-Wardi's sociological theories is insightful but underdeveloped. Provide more examples of how his ideas on post-colonial identity shape modern-day cultural destruction in Iraq, specifically in Mosul.

When discussing Ibn Khaldun's theory of asabiyyah, the connection to modern-day extremist groups is not fully established. Elaborate on how group solidarity led to the destruction of Mosul's artifacts and provide historical parallels.

The mention of "fieldwork and library-based research" is vague. Specify what type of fieldwork was conducted, such as interviews or direct observations, and clarify the primary sources analyzed.

You describe using a mixed-methods approach, but no quantitative data or analysis is presented. Consider either presenting quantitative data (e.g., statistics on destroyed artifacts) or clarifying that this is a qualitative study only.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

In the second paragraph of the introduction, where Weber's theory is introduced, the relationship between belief systems and cultural destruction could be more explicitly connected. Explain how Weber's concept of rationalization relates to both the preservation and destruction of heritage.

The mention of the Lasani and Naghizadeh (2019) study is important, but the description is too general. Include specific insights from their analysis that directly relate to Mosul, rather than discussing general inefficacies of international organizations.

You state that "Heydari stressed the need for serious intervention," but this is vague. Expand on the type of interventions Heydari advocates for and compare them to those mentioned in your own analysis.

The section on identity impacts is comprehensive but could be more tightly linked to your core argument. Ensure that every point made about Iraqi identity directly relates to the destruction or preservation of cultural heritage in Mosul.

The section stating "historical tensions and hardships including wars looting and religious prejudices have contributed to a heterogeneous and oppressed identity" is interesting but needs supporting evidence. Provide specific examples of these tensions influencing cultural destruction.

The discussion on Bedouin influence on Iraqi society is insightful but feels disconnected from the main topic. Clarify how this cultural divide specifically influenced the actions of groups like ISIS in Mosul.

The conclusion is well-written but could be stronger. Revisit the theoretical frameworks discussed (Weber, Ibn Khaldun, and Al-Wardi) and succinctly show how these theories support the main argument. This will give the reader a clearer take-home message.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

## 2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.