




OPEN PEER REVIEW

Challenges and Solutions in Applying Criminological Teachings in Iranian Public Criminal Law

Ali. Aghapour¹, Abbas. Mansoorabadi^{2*}, Abbasali. Akbari³

¹ PhD Candidate in Criminal Law and Criminology, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

² Associate Professor, Department of Criminal Law and Criminology, Farabi College, University of Tehran, Qom, Iran

³ Assistant Professor, Department of Criminal Law and Criminology, Tabriz Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tabriz, Iran

* Corresponding author email address: behmansour@ut.ac.ir

Received: 2024-02-29

Revised: 2024-04-25

Accepted: 2024-05-01

Published: 2024-05-12


EDITOR:

Kaushalya Koralage

Assistant Lecturer in Sociology at University of Colombo, Colombo, Sri Lanka

koralage@iouc.cmb.ac.lk


REVIEWER 1:

Abdus Samad

Assistant Professor, Department of Law, AWKUM, Pakistan

abdussamad@awkum.edu.pk

REVIEWER 2:

Mehmet Yaşar

Department of Sociology, Boğaziçi University, 34342 Bebek, Istanbul, Turkey

mehmetyasardo@bogazici.edu.tr

1. Round 1

1.1. Reviewer 1

Reviewer:

The introduction provides a broad context for the role of criminology in criminal justice but could benefit from a more specific overview of the distinct contributions of criminological research to Iranian law. Consider adding specific examples of how criminological teachings have been implemented in other legal systems to support this claim.

"Criminology as an interdisciplinary scientific field has played a significant role in transforming criminal justice systems in recent decades." This statement would be stronger with references to specific studies or cases illustrating this transformation.

The section discussing limitations in the language of criminal laws is insightful, but the comparison between the terms "chronic delinquency" and "habitual offender" could be expanded. How does this difference in terminology impact the application of criminological findings in practice? Consider adding an example from Iranian law to illustrate this point.

"Criminology examines the entire process from the beginning of crime to its commission, whereas criminal law only focuses on the moment the crime occurs." This is an important distinction, but it would be helpful to explain why this gap exists and how it affects legal outcomes. More detail on the implications for judges and the legal system would add depth.

The critique of imported criminological theories is well-founded, but the section could benefit from specific examples of how such theories have been misapplied in Iranian criminal law. Could you cite specific criminological theories that have been misappropriated?

This section highlights an important societal issue, but it would be strengthened by data or research showing the extent of punitive attitudes in Iranian society. Have there been surveys or studies conducted in Iran on public perceptions of punishment vs. rehabilitation?

The article points out the gap in research methods education but does not specify how this gap could be filled. Could you provide examples of successful criminology curricula from other countries that could be adapted for Iran?

"Another challenge posed by imported theories is the dogmatic adherence to them in academic institutions." This statement could benefit from examples or data supporting this claim. Have there been specific instances of dogmatic adherence in Iranian criminological education?

While the article correctly identifies the lack of awareness as a barrier, it would benefit from a deeper discussion on how awareness could be raised among judicial actors. Are there specific awareness programs or media campaigns that could be implemented?

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

1.2. Reviewer 2

Reviewer:

The discussion of localization is compelling, but more detail is needed on the process of localization. What specific steps can be taken to align criminological teachings with Iran's cultural and social conditions? Providing a clear action plan would enhance the practical value of this section.

"Until criminologists have knowledge of the statistical, cultural, and judicial realities of delinquency in the country, they cannot propose criminological solutions." This is an important statement, but it would be useful to discuss the current limitations in access to such data in Iran. What specific barriers exist?

The article suggests educating judges in criminology and modern penalties, but it lacks detail on how this education should be implemented. Consider adding a proposed structure for training programs or workshops, along with examples of similar successful programs in other countries.

Throughout the article, there is little mention of specific case law or examples from Iranian courts where criminological teachings could have influenced outcomes. Including case studies or judicial examples would make the analysis more grounded in practical realities.

The conclusion effectively summarizes the challenges but could be more forward-looking. It would be helpful to propose a timeline or roadmap for how these challenges might be addressed in the next decade.

Authors revised the manuscript and uploaded the document.

2. Revised

Editor's decision: Accepted.

Editor in Chief's decision: Accepted.